Minutes of the December Monthly Meeting of Clare County Council held in the Council Chamber, Áras Contae an Chláir, New Road, Ennis, Co. Clare on Monday, 11th December, 2017 at 3:45 p.m.

Present:

Councillors J. Breen, J. Flynn, P. Daly, A. Norton, T. McNamara, M. Howard, P. Murphy, C. Colleran Molloy, J. Cooney, P. Hayes, M. Begley, T. O'Brien, P. Burke, A. O'Callaghan, C. Crowe, J. Crowe, G. Flynn, P.J. Ryan, P. McMahon, M. McKee, C. Curtin, R. Nagle, B. Slattery, I. Lynch, M. Hillery, P.J. Kelly, B. Chambers, G. Keating.

- Mr. Pat Dowling, Chief Executive.
- Ms. Carmel Greene, Meetings Administrator.
- Ms. Loretta McNamara, Staff Officer.
- Ms. Anne Haugh, Director of Service.
- Mr. Liam Conneally, Director of Service.
- Mr. Niall Barrett, Head of Finance.
- Mr. Leonard Cleary, A/Director of Service.
- Mr. Sean Lenihan, Senior Engineer.
- Mr. Tom Tiernan, Senior Engineer.
- Ms. Candace Ingram, A/Senior Executive Planner.
- Mr. Gareth Ruane, A/Senior Executive Planner.
- Ms. Congella McGuire, Heritage Officer.

The Cathaoirleach, Cllr. Tom McNamara presided.

Item 1: Minutes of Council Meetings.

a. Ar moladh Cllr. B. Chambers

Cuidithe ag Cllr. B. Slattery agus glacadh leis

"That the Minutes of the Budget 2018 Meeting of Clare County Council held on 10th November, 2017 be adopted and signed."

b. Ar moladh Cllr. B. Chambers Cuidithe ag Cllr. R. Nagle agus glacadh leis

"That the Minutes of the November Meeting of Clare County Council held on 13th November, 2017 be adopted and signed."

Item 2: Matters Arising.

Three matters were considered under this heading.

- 1) The Cathaoirleach advised the members of the documents now circulated to them:
 - a) Directorate and Senior Staff Structure and Functions This completes an action from a motion adopted some months ago. It is intended that this will be reviewed on a regular basis. Cllr. J. Breen thanked the Meetings Administrator for this.
 - b) Notice of a Workshop arranged for Thursday, 18th January, 2018 at 11:00 a.m. to consider a submission to be made by the Council on the Regional Spatial and Economic Strategy for the Southern Region.
- 2) Niall Barrett, Head of Finance referred to Item No. 24 (motion) from the November meeting. He informed the members that the County Solicitor has since provided the response (set out below) in relation to the court attendances by the County Solicitor, representing Clare County Council:

"From examinations of electronic diary records of Michael Houlihan & Partners the following are the number of MHP attendances at District Court, Circuit Court, and High Court Level in the years 2016/2017:

District Court 2016/2017	129
Circuit Court 2016/2017	56
High Court 2016/2017	58

Counsel attendances in the Circuit Court 2016/2017:

(Junior Counsel would ordinarily attend Circuit Court matters save for District Court appeals and fire officer attendances).

Junior Counsel Circuit Court attendances for 2016/2017 was 37.

Counsel Attendances in the High Court 2016/2017:

(In High Court cases Senior and Junior Counsel would ordinarily attend High Court except for ordinary notices of motion where Junior Counsel only would be briefed)

Attendances by Junior Counsel in the High Court was 54

Attendances by Senior Counsel in the High Court was 37."

In relation to this reply Cllr. C. Curtin thanked the Chief Executive for getting this reply and wished this recorded in the minutes.

 Cllr. G. Flynn discussed the response received from the Department of Employment Affairs and Social Protection in relation to contributory pension entitlements and requested that it be forwarded onto the Oireachtas Members and other Local Authorities.

Item 3: Minutes of Municipal District Meetings.

a. Ar moladh Cllr. C. Crowe Cuidithe ag Cllr. M. McKee agus glacadh leis

"That the Minutes of the Shannon Municipal District Meeting held on the 12th September, 2017 be noted."

b. Ar moladh Cllr. G. Flynn Cuidithe ag Cllr. C. Crowe agus glacadh leis

"That the Minutes of the Shannon Municipal District Budget Meeting held on the 20th October, 2017 be noted."

c. Ar moladh Cllr. J. Breen Cuidithe ag Cllr. M. Howard agus glacadh leis

"That the Minutes of the Ennis Municipal District Meeting held on the 10th October, 2017 be noted."

d. Ar moladh Cllr. M. Howard Cuidithe ag Cllr. J. Breen agus glacadh leis

"That the Minutes of the Ennis Municipal District Budget Meeting held on the 25th October, 2017 be noted."

e. Ar moladh Cllr. B. Chambers Cuidithe ag Cllr. M. Hillery agus glacadh leis

"That the Minutes of the West Clare Municipal District Meeting held on the 4th September, 2017 be noted."

f. Ar moladh Cllr. B. Chambers Cuidithe ag Cllr. M. Hillery agus glacadh leis

"That the Minutes of the West Clare Municipal District Budget Meeting held on the 24th October, 2017 be noted."

Item 4: Minutes of S.P.C. Meetings.

a. Ar moladh Cllr. R. Nagle Cuidithe ag Cllr. J. Flynn agus glacadh leis

"That the minutes of the Economic Development S.P.C. meeting held on 11th September, 2017 be noted".

b. Ar moladh Cllr. P. Hayes Cuidithe ag Cllr. M. Howard agus glacadh leis

"That the minutes of the Rural Development S.P.C. meeting held on 12th September, 2017 be noted".

c. Ar moladh Cllr. J. Cooney Cuidithe ag Cllr. C. Curtin agus glacadh leis

"That the minutes of the Physical Development S.P.C. meeting held on 6th October, 2017 be noted".

Item 5: Minutes of the Corporate Policy Group Meetings.

The members noted the minutes of the meeting held on 6th November, 2017 as presented.

Item 6: Monthly Management Report.

The monthly management report attached to the agenda included key activities in the principal service areas and was noted by the members.

Cllr. C. Crowe asked for an update on the Limerick Northern Distributor Road and the Chief Executive advise that he had met with the Consultants and Senior Engineers from both Authorities. Tom Tiernan, Senior Engineer advised that preliminary design work has now recommenced and there will be a briefing held in the coming months.

Cllr. B. Slattery asked if the planning application for Blake's Corner will be lodged before Christmas and the Chief Executive advised that this is still his intention.

Cllr. C. Curtin referred to concerns raised on the drawdown of funding on rural development grant schemes and an article in the Irish Independent on the 28th November, 2017 and the misrepresentations contained within. The Chief Executive and Leonard Cleary, A/Director of Services replied to the query raised and stressed that the Council intends to maximize drawdown of funds, which currently stands at 75%.

Item 7: Proposed disposal of property by lease at Dough, Kilkee, Co. Clare pursuant to Section 183 of the Local Government Act, 2001 and Section 211 of the Planning & Development Act, 2000. Report dated 28th November, 2017 from Carmel Greene, Senior Executive Officer, Corporate Services Department was circulated with the agenda, together with map. The report states that it is proposed to dispose by lease of property at Dough, Kilkee subject to the conditions as set out on the report.

Ar moladh Cllr. B. Chambers Cuidithe ag Cllr. R. Nagle agus glacadh leis

"Notice having been served pursuant to Section 183 of the Local Government Act, 2001, Clare County Council approves pursuant to the powers vested on it at Section 211 of the Planning & Development Act, 2000 as amended, of the disposal (by lease) of property at Dough, Kilkee, Co. Clare subject to the conditions as set out in the notice served on the members dated 28th November, 2017."

Item 8: Proposed disposal of property at The Forge, Rahone, Kilfenora, Co. Clare pursuant to Section 183 of the Local Government Act, 2001 and Section 211 of the Planning & Development Act, 2000.

Report dated 6th December, 2017 from Liam Conneally, Director of Social Development was circulated with the agenda, together with map. The report states that it is proposed to dispose of property at The Forge, Rahone, Kilfenora subject to conditions as set out on the report.

Ar moladh Cllr. B. Slattery

Cuidithe ag Cllr. R. Nagle agus glacadh leis

"Notice having been served pursuant to Section 183 of the Local Government Act, 2001, Clare County Council approves pursuant to the powers vested on it at Section 211 of the Planning & Development Act, 2000 as amended, of the disposal of property at The Forge, Rahone, Kilfenora, Co. Clare subject to the conditions as set out in the notice served on the members dated 29th November, 2017."

Item 9: Proposed disposal of property at 15 Cregaun, Toberteascain, Ennis, Co. Clare pursuant to Section 183 of the Local Government Act, 2001 and Section 211 of the Planning & Development Act, 2000.

Report dated 29th November, 2017 from Monica Meehan, Senior Executive Officer, Rural Development was circulated with the agenda together with map. The report states that it is proposed to dispose of property at 15, Cregaun, Toberteascain, Ennis subject to conditions as set out in the report.

Ar moladh Cllr. M. Howard Cuidithe ag Cllr. J. Breen agus glacadh leis

"Notice having been served pursuant to Section 183 of the Local Government Act, 2001, Clare County Council approves pursuant to the powers vested on it at Section 211 of the Planning & Development Act, 2000 as amended, of the disposal of property at 15, Cregaun, Toberteascain, Ennis, Co. Clare subject to the conditions as set out in the notice served on the members dated 29th November, 2017."

It was proposed by Cllr. J. Cooney and seconded by Cllr. M. Howard that the purchasers of derelict sites be required to bring the site/property up to a certain standard within a specific period of time.

Item 10: Report in accordance with Part XI, Section 179 of the Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended, and Part VIII, Article 80 and 81 of the Planning & Development Regulations 2001-2013 for the proposed works on Mountrivers Bridge, Doonbeg, Co. Clare.

Report dated 1st December, 2017 from John Corry, Administrative Officer, Transportation was circulated with the agenda together with report from A/Senior Executive Planner dated 15th November, 2017. The report states that the proposed development comprises of demolishing the existing three-span bridge and replacing it with a new two-span bridge of reinforced concrete with masonry finish together with ancillary site development works.

Ar moladh Cllr. M. Hillery Cuidithe ag Cllr. G. Keating agus glacadh leis

"That pursuant to Part XI, Section 179 of the Planning and Development Act, 2000 (as amended) and Part VIII, Article 80 and 81 of the Planning and Development Regulations 2001 – 2010, Clare County Council proceed with the proposed development at Mountrivers, Bridge, Doonbeg, Co. Clare."

Item 11: Museum Standards Programme for Clare Museum.

Report dated 27th November, 2017 from Liam Conneally, Director of Social Development was circulated with the agenda. The report states that in order to meet the standards of the Museum Standards Programme for Ireland, of which the Heritage Council are the awarding body, Clare Museum is required to submit evidence of formal approval and adoption by the Museum's governing body of the following documents:

- Clare Museum Strategic Management Plan Implementation/Action Plan 2017
- Clare Museum Disaster Plan 2017 2019
- Clare Museum Care of Collections Strategy 2017-2020
- Clare Museum Education Policy 2017-2019

A central objective of the Museum Standards Programme (M.S.P.I.) for Ireland is to ensure a sustainable future for the museum collections and to maintain services to a high professional standard. The members endorsed the plans and policies as presented.

Item 12: Draft County Clare Heritage Plan 2017-2023.

Report dated 5th December, 2017 from Brian McCarthy, A/Director of Economic Development was circulated with the agenda. The report states that Clare County Council has prepared its third County Clare Heritage Plan 2017-2023 which sets out the vision and direction for heritage management for the next six years and when complete will represent an agreed plan for the future of heritage in County Clare. The County Clare Heritage Plan 2017-2023 will run in parallel with the Clare County Development Plan 2017-2023. The report outlined the Heritage Plan making process under the following headings:

Stage 1 – Pre Draft Stage

Stage 2 - Draft Heritage Plan stage

Stage 3- Public consultation and amendments to the Draft Heritage Plan stage

Stage 4 – Adoption of the Heritage Plan

Cllr. C. Crowe raised the need to maintain the monuments, even the newly erected ones and to make them protected structures.

The Members endorsed the County Clare Heritage Plan 2017 to 2023.

Item 13: Draft Clare Biodiversity Action Plan 2017-2023.

Report dated 5th December, 2017 from Brian McCarthy, A/Director of Economic Development was circulated with the agenda. The report states that Clare County Council has prepared its third County Clare Biodiversity Plan 2017-2023. The County Clare Biodiversity Plan 2017-2023 will run in parallel with the Clare County Development Plan 2017-2023. The report outlined the Bio-Diversity Action Plan making process under the following headings:

- Plan focus
- Environmental Assessment of the Plan
- Public Consultation and the Biodiversity Plan making process
- Summary of the Plan

Cllr. C. Curtin asked that consideration be given to the appointment of Bio-Diversity Officer.

The members endorsed the County Clare Bio-Diversity Action Plan 2017 to 2023.

Item 14. Development contribution scheme.

Ar moladh Cllr. P.J. Kelly Cuidithe ag Cllr. C. Curtin

"That in the interest of rural development and equal treatment of all who endeavour to provide their own homes, the Development Contribution Scheme be amended by deleting column 2(a) (page 5) charges and replacing them with charges listed in column 1 (a) (page 5) and that retrospective financial benefit be accorded to all applications received post April 24, 2017."

Brian McCarthy, A/Director of Economic Development replied as follows:

"Following significant consultation, in accordance with Section 48 of the 2000 Planning and Development Act as amended, the Clare County Development Contribution Scheme 2017-2023 was adopted and made on the 24th April, 2017.

The scheme gives effect to, and is aligned with, the provisions and timescale of the Clare County Development Plan 2017-2023 and sets out a list of projects, public infrastructure and facilities across the County that it is intended to be provided by contributions arising from the scheme. Moreover as required, the basis for the determination of the contributions are also set out in the scheme.

There is no provision in the Planning Acts for the amending of a Development Contribution Scheme - any changes to the terms or charges of the recently adopted scheme would require the preparation and the making of an entirely new Development Contribution Scheme, with consequent requirements for public and statutory consultation and timelines. Any such new scheme which would include the reductions as proposed in the notice of motion, would also require a review and possibly a reduction in the number of projects across the county that could benefit from the scheme.

The members will be aware of the recent initiative introduced by the Planning Department providing for a significant reduction in contributions pertaining to rural houses levied under this current scheme in circumstances where payments are made in full prior to commencement of development. In appreciating the general sentiments of the notice of motion, it is respectfully suggested that the recent early payment initiative achieves a similar outcome, without the necessity of preparing and adopting a new scheme. Moreover, this is evident in the level of take up of the early payment initiative for rural housing which further gives effect to the positive promotion of rural areas as set out in the Clare County Development Plan 2017-2023."

All members were not in agreement with the motion.

The following amendment was proposed by Cllr. G. Flynn, seconded by Cllrs. J. Cooney, R. Nagle, M. Hillery, C. Colleran Molloy, T. O'Brien, B. Chambers, T. McNamara, P. Burke, M. Howard, G. Keating, J. Flynn, B. Slattery, P. Hayes, M. Begley, P. Murphy, J. Crowe, C. Crowe, J. Breen, M. McKee, P. McMahon, P. Daly.

"That the Development Contribution Scheme, as adopted by this Council, remain in place until the required review date. In order to support the objectives of the Rural Development Strategy, we the undersigned propose that the payment incentive scheme of a 25% refund as proposed by the executive following a number of representations from the elected members be afforded to those who were granted planning permission for a single house in the countryside and following payment of the contribution in full through a once off payment or a payment plan post 24th April, 2017."

A vote was called on this amendment which resulted as follows:

In favour: Cllrs. J. Breen, P. Daly, T. McNamara, P. Murphy, C. Colleran Molloy, J. Cooney, P. Hayes, M. Begley, T. O'Brien, P. Burke, A. O'Callaghan, C. Crowe, G.

Flynn, P. McMahon, M. McKee, R. Nagle, B. Slattery, M. Hillery, B. Chambers, G. Keating (20)

Against: Cllrs. P.J. Kelly. (1)

Abstentions: Cllrs. A. Norton, P.J. Ryan and C. Curtin. (3)

The Cathaoirleach declared the amendment carried.

While Cllr. C. Curtin sought that a vote be taken on the original motion, the Cathaoirleach ruled that under Standing Order No. 28 the original motion ceases to exist when the amendment is carried.

The Cathaoirleach welcomed Mr. Denis O'Donovan, Chairperson of the Seanad, who was visiting the Council.

Item 15. Follow up actions to motions.

Ar moladh Cllr. C. Curtin

Cuidithe ag Cllrs. J. Flynn, P.J. Kelly, I. Lynch agus G. Flynn agus glacadh leis

"That a report for its consideration be presented to the elected membership of the Council on follow-up actions to motions adopted by the Council during the past 12 months relating directly to its functions and administration."

Carmel Greene, Senior Executive Officer, Corporate Services Department replied as follows:

"In an effort to improve follow up on all motions adopted by the Council, a new electronic system was put in place to track the progress on motions. This was put in place in September 2017 and to date, motions for the months since June 2017 have been updated. The system has proven to be of benefit particularly in ensuring that replies are received from Government Departments or other statutory agencies.

The following Table summarises the total number of motions, those passed, not passed and deferred.

		DECISONS TAKEN		
Month	No. of motions	Passed	Not passed	Deferred
June 2017	20	18	1	1
July 2017	17	16		1
September 2017	13	13		
October 2017	14	14		
November	19	19		

Total for 5	83	80	1	2
months				

Following the passing of a motion at a Council meeting, a status is assigned to the motion and follow up actions are then done which results in the status of the motion being given one of the following:

- Actions required following adoption, the motion is assigned to a Director of Service or staff member for further action.
- Actioned An example of this is where the motion has been referred by me to a Government Department or another statutory agency.
- **Closed** this status applies when the request or action required in the motion has been fully completed.
- **Deferred** This arises where the motion has been deferred to another meeting.

STATUS AT DECEMBER 2017 Month No. of motions Closed Actioned Action required passed 4 June 2017 18 13 1 16 July 2017 16 3 9 1 September 2017 13 October 2017 4 14 10 November 19 7 7 5 9 **Total for 5** 80 55 16 months (69%) (20%)(11%)

The following table shows the current status of the motions passed since June 2017 and this is continually being updated.

There are various reporting options in the new system which will provide good information for us to provide to elected members and to the executive.

We continually work to progress those motions with a status of "action required" and "actioned" and reminders are being issued when required.

We are also reviewing the status of motions pre June 2017 so that those that are not yet actioned will be entered on the system. When this is done, I will issue an updated report to the members."

Councillors acknowledged that a start had been made but felt more progress was required. While notice of motions were agreed at county level they felt in some instances the actions were not been carried out on the ground. It is the duty of the Chief Executive to carry out the wishes of the Council where they are lawful.

Cllr. I. Lynch would like to access this on the extranet. Cllr. J. Flynn wished to know could the system be tweaked to show local and national affairs separately. Cllr. J. Breen asked that the system be replicated in the Municipal Districts.

The Chief Executive replied on the progress made to-date and will work to improve the response and communication on the follow-up on motions adopted. He advised that Carmel Greene, Senior Executive Officer will be going out to the Municipal Districts. He committed giving access to Councillors to the system to see the progress on their motions. Any actions we take must have resources to ensure they happen. If a motion is closed it means it has happened but perhaps, on some occasions, not to the satisfaction of the Councillor. If motions are not adequately dealt with at district level, it may result in the motion arising again at county level.

Cllr. J. Breen asked for update on business review, in particular to ensure that officials reply to elected members. The Chief Executive asked that he be made aware of specific instances where this arises. Cllr. G. Keating stated that while we are getting replies, funding is a key reason why work is not being done. Cllr. T. O'Brien pointed out that there are no issues with getting replies from officials in Killaloe Municipal District and this situation was confirmed by Cllr. G. Flynn in relation to Shannon Municipal District. This was supported by members.

Upon the request of Cllr. C. Crowe Item No. 24 was brought forward.

Item 24. Papal visit to Ireland.

Ar moladh Cllr. C. Crowe

Cuidithe ag Cllr. T. O'Brien agus glacadh leis

"The Clare County Council liaise with Bishop Fintan Monahan, the Minister for Foreign Affairs and Shannon Airport management to formulate an appropriate invitational itinerary to Pope Francis to coincide with his expected visit to Ireland in 2018."

Cllr. C. Crowe outlined his reasons for bringing forward this motion and pointed out that the Pope is still the Bishop of Kilfenora.

Carmel Greene, Senior Executive Officer advised that initial contact has already been made with the organizers of the World Meeting of Families 2018, but as yet, there is no confirmation that His Holiness, Pope Francis is coming to Ireland.

Item 16. Resources for statutory enforcement.

Ar moladh Cllr. A. Norton Cuidithe ag Cllr. G. Flynn agus glacadh leis

"I am requesting that Clare County Council allocate more resources into statutory enforcement such as planning, waste, illegal camping and all other areas that are being flouted."

Liam Conneally, Director of Social Development replied as follows:

"Various Departments within Clare County Council have duties and responsibilities in enforcing the various legislative provisions. Many of the enforcement processes are quite complex and can involve cross-directorate working. The following sets out the current structures in each of the areas listed and the nature of enforcement that they carry out.

Planning Enforcement

In relation to enforcement of the planning code, a dedicated unit is in place and is overseen by an Acting Senior Executive Planner and is staffed by one planning enforcement officer and 3 administrative staff (Staff Officer, Assistant Staff Officer and Clerical Officer). So far in 2017, the Department has received a total of 104 complaints. A total of 117 warning letters have been issued and a total of 56 enforcement notices issued. Legal proceedings have also commenced on 3 files this year.

The focus on 2018 is continuing the progressing of the enforcement electronic database and file management system leading to increased efficiencies in case management.

Waste Enforcement

Clare County Council has a dedicated Waste Enforcement Unit. The staffing structure is determined by Department of Communications, Climate Action and Environment funding which assists the Council in maintaining current high standards in environmental enforcement. This grant funds the multi disciplinary waste enforcement team, which investigates illegal dumping, monitors waste facility permits and certificates, and oversees compliance with all relevant regulatory waste legislation. An additional community warden was recruited in 2017 to assist in the response to illegal dumping and there is now a dedicated resource in each Municipal District.

A recent Environmental Enforcement Performance Assessment Report produced by the EPA for the years 2014 - 2016 has rated Clare County Council as "Excellent" in the delivery of its environmental enforcement role.

Illegal Encampments

In respect of illegal encampments, the Council has carried out an audit of all current illegal encampments. The Social Directorate is currently examining its enforcement options and other housing support options in relation to such illegal encampments."

Cllr. A. Norton expressed concern in relation to what it is costing Clare County Council in dealing with the dumping and illegal encampments, the stress it is putting on people living in the area and the negative effect on our tourism industry.

Cllr. G. Flynn felt that most of the reply related to environmental issues and while he was glad to see the use of CCTV he felt that the Council was being more reactive than

proactive. He spoke about the work being done under the Housing Strategic Policy Committee and the links between the various Departments to monitor and address those flouting the law. He asked for the costs of the gates erected on the illegal encampment on the Ennis Bypass.

Cllr. J. Breen asked to know how many of the warning letters and enforcement notices have been complied with, as he knows of instances where such notices have been flouted. He was advised that the break-down would be provided to him.

Liam Conneally, Director of Services replied to the queries raised.

Item 17. Service Level Agreement.

Ar moladh Cllr. P.J. Ryan

"That this Council would clarify the position regarding the Service Level Agreement with Irish Water scheduled to run until 2025."

Anne Haugh, Director of Physical Development replied as follows:

"The Members will be aware that there is a 12 year Service Level Agreement (S.L.A.) in place between Irish Water and each individual local authority effective from January 1st 2014 and running until the end of 2025. The members will be further aware from a recent media article that Irish Water has signaled its intention not to renew Service Level Agreements with local authorities when the current agreements expire and have also expressed a preference to move towards a single public utility model at the earlier stage of 2021.

The current position is that the Service Level Agreement between Clare County Council and Irish Water has not been amended and remains in place until/unless an alternative arrangement is agreed between all relevant stakeholders."

Cllr. P.J. Ryan reiterated his understanding that Irish Water wishes to terminate the Service Level Agreements (S.L.A.s) and this would have serious consequences for both the County and the employees. While he understands that Irish Water will take on Council staff, he is concerned that they may not wish to join Irish Water.

Anne Haugh advised that since the establishment of Irish Water the number of staff has reduced due to technology advancements etc. and that currently there are 110 full-time equivalents paid for under the Service Level Agreement and financial costs in the area of €10m. are recouped from Irish Water. The Chief Executive advised that the Service Level Agreement is still in place and he gave a full commitment to inform the Members as soon as or if he hears of any impending change on this matter.

It was agreed to take Items 18 and 27 together.

Item 18. Maintenance and dredging of rivers and tributaries.

Ar moladh Cllr. P. Hayes Cuidithe ag Cllr. J. Cooney agus glacadh leis

"I am asking Clare County Council to put in place a comprehensive plan for the ongoing maintenance and dredging of the main rivers and tributaries in this county. Lack of ongoing maintenance of these rivers is now causing major flooding problems on main and minor roads and that this Council seek government funding to address this long term problem."

Tom Tiernan, Senior Engineer, Transportation replied as follows:

"On foot of a notice of motion in 2016 with similar intent, a cross sectoral group involving the local authority, the O.P.W., the I.F.A and Inland Fisheries met with a view to establishing the extent, nature, causes, solutions, responsibilities etc. in relation to flooding situations which arise across the county. To facilitate the meeting, some initial details were collated by Municipal District Engineers which, when broadly analysed, indicated the following outline details:

110 locations were identified where significant flooding situations arise from time to time.

102 of these affect roads.

In 63 situations private lands are affected and

In 15 situations buildings are affected or at risk.

In 50 of the 110 situations the local authority has responsibility.

In 19 situations the O.P.W. has responsibility.

In 53 situations the responsibility lies with private property owners.

The E.S.B. and C.I.E. each have responsibility in relation to one situation.

Depending on criteria to be applied, one could spend from ten to fifty million euro in providing resolution, where feasible, in relation to the locations/situations identified.

Following on from the initial meeting as referred to above, the intention had been to develop more detailed information with a view to development of an overall plan/strategy to deal with the issue. Notwithstanding the fact that the resources (both financial and human) haven't been available to progress this forward to any significant degree, the information already collated has been useful to a limited extent in terms of its capacity to help identify responsibility, potential sources of funding and so on. Most of the key deficiencies and dredging requirements are identified within the 9 drainage districts for which the Council has responsibility. Also potential O.P.W. minor works proposals are flagged for consideration in relation to feasibility and justification.

However, the potential benefits of what has been done to date, in terms of development of a picture of the pertinent issues across Co. Clare, have to be considered against a background which can be summed up as follows:

Given the economic climate over recent years it has not been possible to provide the level of funding from Council's own resources as would be desirable for the maintenance of waterways in the drainage districts for which the council has responsibility. Realistically the only other source of funding available to facilitate dealing with periodic flooding situations is the O.P.W. Minor Works Programme. While this programme has facilitated several schemes successfully over the past no. of years, capacity to get approval for such schemes is very much constrained by the requirement to prove positive Benefit Cost Ratio (B.C.R.) and mitigation of potential adverse impact on the environment.

A very large proportion of the waterway systems throughout Co. Clare are the responsibility of the property owners in which they are located and don't fall within the remit of the Council or any other state body.

Overall, I concur fully with the intent and objectives associated with this notice of motion. To develop a comprehensive plan to build on the information which has already been collated as referred to above will require significant additional resources to be provided on an annual basis."

Item 27. River channel cleaning works.

Ar moladh Cllr. J. Cooney Cuidithe ag Cllr. P. Hayes agus glacadh leis

"That Clare County Council request the O.P.W. to include Clare in the recently announced pilot scheme which will provide specific funding towards river channel cleaning works in light of recent flooding of both lands and roads."

Both Councillors J. Cooney and P. Hayes outlined their reasons for putting forward these motions and a number of Councillors expressed their support for these motions.

Cllr. P. Hayes requested that we contact the Department to put a national programme in place and that we should also set aside some money from our own budget to deal with these issues.

Cllr. J. Cooney said that flooding had worsened in recent years. He advised that Minister "Boxer" Moran has announced a pilot scheme for Leitrim and Sligo and felt that Clare County Council should apply to be part of this pilot project.

Cllr. J. Crowe spoke of the great improvements following the dredging done in the O'Garney River in Sixmilebridge. Cllr. G. Flynn raised the need for the embankments in Shannon to be addressed and asked for an update on same. He asked that the Airport and the Town of Shannon be looked at as a uniform solution in relation to the embankments.

Tom Tiernan, Senior Engineer responded to the issues raised by Members. He said that this was primarily a funding issue and now that the down-turn is coming to an end that money should now become available to carry out the necessary maintenance work. In relation to the Shannon Embankments a geo-technical investigation is being carried out. In relation to the pilot project referred to by Cllr. J. Cooney he had been in contact with the O.P.W., who were not aware of this but he would follow up on it.

Item 19. Public Consultation for Planned Major Works.

Ar moladh Cllr. P. Murphy

"What level of public consultation is undertaken by Clare County Council in advance of planned major works that necessitate prolonged full road closures?"

Tom Tiernan, Senior Engineer, Transportation replied as follows:

"The level and nature of public consultation in such circumstances can vary from one situation to the next depending on the particular circumstances which pertain. The notice of motion refers to "planned major works" which would suggest works that, in the vast majority of cases, require formal planning approval. Therefore, in all such circumstances, the first step from a public consultation point of view would be via the formal public consultation opportunity facilitated by the planning process – all submissions from the general public are considered in detail before the process is concluded. Before such formal planning procedures are initiated whether it be via An Bord Pleanála or the Part VIII process, Councillors are made aware of the intention in advance – particularly at Municipal District level.

Pending approval of the formal planning application, the next step from a public consultation point of view centres around the advance procedures pertaining to the road closure which is facilitated by Section 75 of the 1993 Roads Act. The process commences 6 - 8 weeks in advance of the intended road closure and the consultation period facilitates members of the general public in submitting their observations, objections, suggestions etc. – all of which are considered in detail before a final decision is made regarding whether the proposed road closure is to proceed as originally intended, whether it is to proceed with some modifications to the original proposal or whether it is to be cancelled or deferred.

Outside of the aforementioned two formal public consultation opportunities, the Council facilitates more informal liaison. The nature and extent of this depends on the individual circumstances which pertain in the situation – much of which would have been articulated through the aforementioned formal consultations. Such liaison may include inter alia

- The issue of advance press statements advising on the nature and extent of the proposed closure, details of diversions where further information can be availed of and so on.
- Local radio interviews to elaborate on the aforementioned press statement or in response to particular issues raised through representations etc.
- Direct liaison with key stakeholders such as emergency services, bus companies and others depending on the nature of representations previously made and so on.
- Publication of information leaflets through various modes including door to door delivery to advise of details of situation including timing, implications, alternative routes, relevant advice and contact details and so on.

Apart from the foregoing, we are happy to meet with representatives of local interest groups to discuss any issues which are of concern. Such meetings normally come about at the instigation of the particular groups or individuals themselves – either directly or via representation through public representatives. Where we can implement additional measures to help mitigate the potentially adverse impact of temporary road closures, we do so. Because of the unique circumstances and

consequences which would normally pertain as a result of each and every road closure situation, mitigating measures don't always achieve the desired outcome to best effect when first implemented and some adjustment, in consultation with local people, may be necessary. In this context, there can be an element of trial and monitoring in the early stages during which we are happy to liaise with local representatives and there may be an element of bearing with us while we endeavour to get alternative arrangements working to best effect. It is, of course, regrettable that the adverse impacts generated by necessary prolonged road closures cannot be fully reversed during the course of such closures."

Cllr. P. Murphy asked for impact studies to be carried out prior to imposing road closures of a long duration and for improved public consultation.

Item 20. Value for public money.

Ar moladh Cllr. G. Flynn

Cuidithe ag Cllr. C. Curtin agus glacadh leis

"That Clare County Council in the interest of accountability and transparency concerning the spending of public money show proper oversight of each spend and monitor the value for public money as a priority in making sure members of the public see the benefits of each project carried out by the Council in County Clare."

Niall Barrett, Head of Finance replied as follows:

Procurement of Goods and Services

A key part of the process for achieving value for money is the procurement processes that an organisation uses in acquiring goods and services required by the organisation. Procurement in all public bodies, including Clare County Council, is governed by National and EU legislation. The value of the contract determines the procurement procedure to be followed and the frequency in which the contract is tendered. There are other factors that also effect the frequency including the nature of the goods or services required, with many service contracts being of longer duration.

Most tenders are advertised on the eTenders website. This is a public sector procurement portal where all public sector bodies advertise public tenders and where any service provider/contractor can register free of charge and express interest and view details of any tender competition being ran by any public body.

In addition, contracts for many common goods and services (such as utilities, professional services and stationery) are put in place nationally by the Office of Government Procurement (O.G.P.) for use by other public bodies, and these competitions are also advertised publically on eTenders and, if required on the Official Journal of the EU (O.J.E.U.). Within these tender competitions, framework competitions are often run for specific areas. Companies that are successful in the competition are placed on a panel of entities to supply under that framework. Then as individual contract supply opportunities arise, mini-competitions are run between all framework members to establish who will be the supplier for that particular contract. Mini-competitions are limited to existing framework participants.

In situations where goods or services are required which fall below the thresholds for the above processes then a Request for Quotations (R.F.Q.'s) process is used. These

R.F.Q.s are also commonly advertised on the Supplygov website. The Supplygov site is another public procurement portal used by public bodies.

Quotations and tenders are sought by the Council on a daily basis and in many cases, quotations are sought directly from known suppliers, in full compliance with procurement procedures, as the value of the goods is low.

The monthly Management Report provided to members includes details of all publically advertised tenders during the previous month.

Public Spending Code

The Public Spending Code (P.S.C.) issued by the Department of Public Expenditure and Reform sets out the approaches to be applied to all aspects of the expenditure life cycle from when a proposal is put together, through its implementation and beyond when post completion reviews are undertaken. The code includes a requirement for quality assurance reviews annually to assess how the organisation is meeting the P.S.C. requirements. This detailed review process is carried out by the council each year. The results of the review are provided to the National Oversight and Audit Committee (N.O.A.C.), the statutory body set up by ministerial order to oversee the local government sector.

Local Government Audit

The Local Government audit service periodically carry out value for money assessments across all local authorities in relation to particular areas of service and issues reports to local authorities with recommended improvements in practices that have arisen as part of the review. This is in addition to the regular annual audits that are carried out by the audit service from which any areas requiring attention are dealt with in the audit report issued to members.

In addition to the foregoing there are a number of other ways in which the expenditure cycle of the council is examined. These include:

- Ongoing financial reporting to council whereby expenditure is reviewed against budget for the year.
- The work of the audit committee of the council, which may enquire into any area of activity of the council. The audit committee has an independent chair as well as two other non council members, in addition to two councillor members. The audit committee members have significant combined experience in local government, financial accounting and reporting, banking, audit as well as other commercial areas.
- Reviews carried out by the internal audit group within the council."

Cllr. G. Flynn expressed his satisfaction with response on procurement but felt that there needs to be an oversight on the benefit to the community. He felt that the Council needed to engage positively to demonstrate to the public the value of the

projects. In seconding the motion, Cllr. C. Curtin said that both the social and economic dividend needed to be made clear. Cllr. P.J. Ryan said that Value for Money does not have to be the cheapest tender.

Item 21. Micro Business Hubs.

Ar moladh Cllr. C. Curtin

"That the Director of Services update the Council on the details (including functions) and locations of micro-business hubs as identified for Clare towns and the consequent marketing campaign to promote their role and significance in the social and economic life of the county."

Leonard Cleary, A/Director of Rural Development replied as follows:

"The Rural Development Directorate through its Broadband and Digital Officer is currently preparing a Digital Strategy. This draft will be presented to the Council in early 2018. One of the components of the strategy will involve the development of high speed broadband hot desks. These will be available in 5 Hubs facilitating access for micro-enterprises, rural business and farming sector who may require high broadband speeds. The first 3 Hubs will be opened in Kilrush Town Hall, Main Street Miltown Malbay and Feakle in early 2018.

Subsequently other Hubs will be developed in Ennis and Ennistymon. It is acknowledged that Shannon Group is currently developing a Hub in Shannon and the private sector is developing a Hub in Killaloe. The infrastructure will be provided by the Digital and I.T. Department. The Local Enterprise Office will operate the booking service for the hot desks and will market the service to clients. In addition the I.D.A., Enterprise Ireland and Leader have expressed interest in referring small business clients to the facilities and also those involved in remote working for large multinational firms."

Cllr. C. Curtin expressed his complements to the Directorate that in five months they would have three hubs in place in early 2018.

Cllr. J. Flynn wished to know was there any timeline in relation to a hub in Ennis. Leonard Cleary, A/Director of Services advised that they were currently looking for a site to lease and hopefully this would be in place by the first quarter of 2019.

Item 22. Capital Infrastructure Funding Working Group.

Ar moladh Cllr. J. Flynn Cuidithe ag Cllr. C. Curtin

"That Clare County Council urgently set up a "Capital Infrastructure Funding Working Group" made up of officials and two elected members from each Municipal District.

This is in response to National and Regional Plans, Strategies etc. that have an impact on receipt of infrastructure funding in Clare. Such a working group could undertake tasks for example; such as development of economically important infrastructure "shopping list" for County Clare to provide input into development of upcoming critical Regional Spatial & Economic Strategy as set down to be prepared under NPF Ireland 2040; with reference for example on strategic roads as per table 7.3 of adopted MWASP 2012-2030."

Brian McCarthy, A/Director of Economic Development replied as follows:

"The Clare County Development Plan 2017-2023 sets out the overall economic, infrastructural, recreation and amenity projects required over the lifetime of the Plan and beyond. This is supported by the Development Contribution Scheme which was prepared in tandem with the Development Plan and sets out a list of key projects and priorities that the Contribution Scheme will fund.

Moreover, over the next number of months, a Regional Spatial and Economic Strategy will be prepared which also will set high level goals and key infrastructure to unlock the potential of County Clare and drive economic development and infrastructure onwards.

In noting and appreciating the merit of such a group proposed in the Notice of Motion it is respectfully considered that the existing Clare County Development Plan 2017-2023, the Development Contribution Scheme 2017-2023 and existing budgetary and financial mechanisms in place within the local authority are best placed to deliver the outcomes as envisaged by this notice of motion."

A number of Councillors expressed the view that at present another committee was not required.

The Chief Executive acknowledged that this was a decision for members but at the present time did not think we needed another committee. He advised that many workshops were being done on various subjects including the Regional Spatial and Economic Strategy. In the fullness of time, there may be a need for a sub-committee but not at the present time. He advised that Clare County Council has gone on e-Tenders seeking to appoint consultants to develop a 20 year plan for developing Ennis, the County Town and that he will also be looking at other towns including Shannon.

The Cathaoirleach asked Cllr. J. Flynn would he defer this notice of motion and he agreed to this.

Item 23. Higher Education funding.

Ar moladh Cllr. M. McKee Cuidithe ag Cllr. G. Flynn agus glacadh leis

"That this Council hear a deputation from the Union of Students Ireland in relation to funding of Higher Education."

The Cathaoirleach suggested that the deputation from the Union of Students Ireland be invited to attend the February meeting and this was agreed.

Item 25. Assistance for Clare farmers.

Ar moladh Cllr. M. Hillery Cuidithe ag Cllr. R. Nagle agus glacadh leis

"That Clare County Council requests the Minister for Agriculture to put a plan in place to help Clare farmers through an imminent fodder crisis next year."

It was agreed that this notice of motion should be forwarded onto the I.C.M.A., I.F.A. Macra na Feirme and other Local Authorities.

Item 26. Aer Lingus routes from Shannon Airport.

Ar moladh Cllr. P. McMahon Cuidithe ag Cllr. P. Daly agus glacadh leis

"In light of the recent announcement of ten new Aer Lingus routes to the U.S.A. from Dublin Airport, I now call on Mr. Stephen Kavanagh, Chief Executive, Aer Lingus to consider scheduling at least one of those routes to depart and arrive at Shannon Airport as we have the resources to facilitate and market this."

Cllr. P. McMahon advised that Dublin Airport is now the 5th largest airport in Europe and that while Shannon has the infrastructure if we do not have connectivity people will go to other places, including Dublin. Cllr. P. Daly expressed the view that it appears that Aer Lingus has abandoned Shannon and would like to invite our Oireachtas Members and the Minister for Transport Shane Ross to discuss this matter with the Council. A number of Councillors expressed the view that if the Government is serious about balanced regional development and the spatial strategy they need to support Shannon Airport.

The Cathaoirleach asked members would they agree to an extension of 5 minutes in order to complete the business of the meeting and this was agreed.

Item 28. Allocations of funding.

Ar moladh Cllr. G. Keating Cuidithe ag Cllr. T. O'Brien agus glacadh leis

"That Clare County Council request the various government bodies to make all allocations of funding available early 2018 in order to facilitate local authorities to spend that funding within the calendar year."

Councillors expressed the view that it was very difficult to put schemes of work together without knowing what funds would be available.

It was agreed to write to the Department requesting that funds would be made available early in the year.

Item 29. Micro chipping of dogs.

Ar moladh Cllr. M. Howard Cuidithe ag Cllr. J. Flynn agus glacadh leis

"Further to recent communications I have had with the I.F.A. regarding the Control of Dogs Act, Clare County Council requests the relevant government departments to streamline and make more accessible the data collected in the micro-chipping of dogs."

Cllr. M. Howard advised that while 85% of dogs are micro chipped, the information is kept on four different data bases instead of one. She also feels that the owners P.P.S. information should also be held.

The Members agreed to forward this motion to the Minister for Agriculture and the Minister for the Environment.

Item 30. Waste water infrastructure.

Ar moladh Cllr. B. Chambers

Cuidithe ag Cllr. G. Keating agus glacadh leis

"I call on Irish Water for a complete analysis on the "fit for purpose capacity" of the waste water facilities in Co. Clare that can support the population and to complete a baseline study to document the waste water infrastructure in Co. Clare."

The Members asked that this motion be sent also to the Minister for the Environment.

Item 31. Comhfhreagras. Correspondence.

Correspondence.

The following correspondence was circulated with the agenda:

- Correspondence dated 9th November, 2017 from the Department of Communications, Climate Action and Environment in relation to the Post Office Network.
- 2. Correspondence dated 6th November, 2017 from Leonard Cleary, A/Director of Rural Development in relation to deputation from Clare County Council that met Minister Regina Doherty, Minister for Employment and Social Protection in relation to social/community employment projects.
- 3. Correspondence dated 30th November, 2017 from the Department of Employment Affairs and Social Protection in relation to the state pension provision.

- 4. Correspondence dated 17th November, 2017 from the Department of Transport, Tourism and Sport regarding tree felling.
- 5. Correspondence dated 15th November, 2017 from the Office of the Taoiseach in relation to Shannon Airport.
- 6. Correspondence dated 15th November, 2017 from the Office of the Taoiseach in relation to the National Housing Co-op Bill 2017.
- Correspondence dated 15th November, 2017 from the Office of the Minister for Employment Affairs and Social Protection in connection with the encouragement of skilled and trained young people who had to emigrate during the recession to return home.
- 8. Correspondence dated 29th November, 2017 from the Office of the Minister for Public Expenditure and Reform in relation to EU fines.
- 9. Resolution circulated by Kilkenny Council in relation to training for teachers.
- 10. Resolution circulated by Carlow County Council in relation to requirements for persons with disabilities.
- 11. Resolution circulated by Leitrim County Council in relation to Community based CCTV system installation in towns.
- 12. Elected members training seminar entitled "Local Authorities and Regional Assemblies Managing Executive Governance" taking place in the Connacht Hotel, Dublin Road, Galway on $15^{\text{th}} 16^{\text{th}}$ December, 2017.
- Conference entitled "The Finance Act 2017" taking place in the Four Seasons Hotel, Carlingford, Co. Louth on 5th – 7th January, 2018.
- 14. Conference entitled "Entitlement to Health Services" taking place in the Clonakilty Hotel, Clonakilty, Co. Cork on 19th 21st January, 2018.
- 29th Colmcille Winter School Conference taking place in Colmcille Heritage Centre, Gartan, Churchill, Letterkenny, Co. Donegal on 23rd and 24th February, 2018.

Conferences.

Reports on Seminars/Conferences attended.

With regard to seminars/conferences attended, reports completed in accordance with Section 142 of the Local Government Act 2001 were made available at the meeting.

AILG Training Seminar entitled "National Planning Framework Ireland 2040" taking place in Dooley's Hotel, Waterford on 11th February, 2017.

The Meetings Administrator informed the Members that the estimated average cost per Councillor attending this Conference was €361.83 including conference fee of €50.

It was agreed that Cllr. P. Hayes attend this Conference.

LAMA Autumn Seminar entitled "Waste Management – Better Energy" taking place in Hotel Minella, Coleville Road, Clonmel, Co. Tipperary on 29th – 30th September, 2017.

The Meetings Administrator informed the Members that the estimated average cost per Councillor attending this Conference was €490.02 including conference fee of €160.

It was agreed that Cllrs. C. Crowe and P. Hayes attend this Conference.

AILG Training Seminar entitled "Welling for Councillors" taking place in Silver Spring Hotel, Cork on 23rd September, 2017.

The Meetings Administrator informed the Members that the estimated average cost per Councillor attending this Conference was €296.03 including conference fee of €50.

It was agreed that Cllr. C. Crowe attend this Conference.

AILG Autumn Training Seminar entitled taking place in Sligo Park Hotel, Sligo on 12th & 13th October, 2017.

The Meetings Administrator informed the Members that the estimated average cost per Councillor attending this Conference was €564.45 including conference fee of €125.

It was agreed that Cllr. B. Chambers attend this Conference.

Conference entitled "What does a hard Brexit mean for Ireland" taking place in the Clonakilty Hotel, Clonakilty, Co. Cork on 20th – 22nd October, 2017.

The Meetings Administrator informed the Members that the estimated average cost per Councillor attending this Conference was €468.17 including conference fee of €100.

It was agreed that Cllr. C. Crowe attend this Conference.

AILG Training Seminar entitled taking place in Kilkenny on 26th October, 2017.

The Meetings Administrator informed the Members that the estimated average cost per Councillor attending this Conference was €324.69 including conference fee of €50.

It was agreed that Cllr. G. Keating attend this Conference.

AILG Training Seminar taking place in Gorey, Co. Wexford on 14th November, 2017.

The Meetings Administrator informed the Members that the estimated average cost per Councillor attending this Conference was €394.57 including conference fee of €50.

It was agreed that Cllrs. G. Keating and T. O'Brien attend this Conference.

AILG Training Seminar taking place in Dunboyne, Co. Meath on 18th November, 2017.

The Meetings Administrator informed the Members that the estimated average cost per Councillor attending this Conference was €383.82 including conference fee of €50.

It was agreed that Cllrs. R. Nagle, B. Chambers, M. Howard, J. Crowe and C. Crowe attend this Conference.

Conference entitled "Prosecution for violence against women" taking place in Civic Offices, Wood Quay, Dublin 8 on 8th December, 2017.

The Meetings Administrator informed the Members that the estimated average cost per Councillor attending this Conference was €541.36.

It was agreed that Cllr. J. Crowe attend this Conference.

The Cathaoirleach thanked the Members and Executive for their work during 2017 and wished them a Happy Christmas and New Year. He also thanked the Media for their work in delivering the message on the Council's work programmes.

The meeting then concluded.

Signed:

Riarthóir Cruinnithe

Signed:

Cathaoirleach

Date: